



DRAFT MINUTES (SUBJECT TO COMMITTEE APPROVAL)

**NOMINATING COMMITTEE FOR THE COMMISSION ON APPELLATE
COURT APPOINTMENTS**

Friday, May 31, 2024

11:00 A.M.

STATE CAPITOL EXECUTIVE TOWER

1700 W. WASHINGTON STREET

TELECONFERENCE

PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

Members Via Conference Call: Angeles Maldonado, Mark Barnes, Pinny Sheoran, Rachel Gray, Ruben Alonzo

Members Absent: Jandi Craig, Juliana Urtubey, Lynn Constabile

Staff: Sean Berens, Jillian Donegan

-
- 1. Call to Order:** Meeting of the Nominating Committee for the Commission on Appellate Court Appointments (“Nominating Committee”) called to order at 11:13 a.m. Sean Berens took attendance, welcomed the committee and reviewed the minutes from 7/11/2023. Mr. Berens called for comments on the minutes. Pinny Sheoran moved to accept the minutes. Mark Barnes seconded the motion. All voted in favor.
 - 2. Review of statutory requirements:** Mr. Berens explained the makeup of the commission and reviewed the constitutional requirements for appointments to the Commission as stated in the Arizona Constitution, Article VI, Section 36; noting that none of the applicants hold an appointive office. All meet criteria for service on the commission.
 - 3. Discussion of applicants:** Ruben Alonzo expressed support for all candidates, believes all applicants are qualified and is comfortable with moving everyone forward as he has no pause or concern for any applicant in particular. Mark Barnes agreed with Ruben Alonzo’s statement and added that the applicants’ high level of experience (from journalism to high tech) is impressive and would move the whole list to the Governor. The discussion transitioned for committee members who have more insights or direct knowledge of any specific applicants’ background to share or clarify their reason(s) for their support and/ or opposition for consideration. Angeles Maldonado requested that members offer more details on opposition to specific applicants. Rachel Gray and Pinny Sheoran expressed opposition to recommending Mignonne Hollis. Ruben Alonzo raised the point that there are more Maricopa applicants on the list to potentially send up and suggested the committee considers the applicants in other counties as well to offer some balance/other options for the Governor to consider. Inquiry from Pinny Sheoran regarding how critical it is for applicants to have legal background. Ruben Alonzo offered insights to address this question and Mr. Berens reiterated that both perspectives (Attorney and Non Attorney) are needed and the intention is that the diversity of the state is reflected as closely as possible. The committee considered looking at a two tiered option to elevate the “highly recommended” applicants as done previously and also weighed whether or not separate motions would be favorable. The committee concluded that only one motion would be necessary as the goal is to recommend the most qualified applicants. The committee agreed to send the “Top 6” applicants to the Governor.
 - 4. Call to the public:** No comments.

5. Selection of applicants for recommendation to the Governor:

Pinny Sheoran moved to recommend:

- Sonya Willis
- Kristin Gilger
- Julia Bertoni
- Morgan Finkelstein
- Eric Nielsen
- Bryan Taylor

Rachel Gray seconded the motion. Ruben Alonzo supported the motion.

All voted in favor of the motion.

Vote on Motion

Angeles Maldonado– Yes

Mark Barnes – Yes

Pinny Sheoran – Yes

Rachel Gray – Yes

Ruben Alonzo – Yes

Motion passes unanimously.

6. Adjournment: Pinny Sheoran moved to adjourn, Rachel Gray seconded. All voted in favor. The meeting adjourned at 11:44 a.m